Research Proposal

**To The University of Bangor**

By

Thomas Ulrich Kurt

Scheidgasse 59

3800 Unterseen

Switzerland

Student Number: \_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_

Phone: ++41 33822 6221

Email: t.kurt@bewegungplus.ch

**For a MPhil/PhD Research**

in the School of Philosophy and Religion for

**the Centre for Pentecostal and Charismatic Studies**

Supervisor Prof. Dr. Frank D. Macchia

October 2014

**Table of Contents**

1 Abstract 1

2 Scope of the Study 1

2.1 Title of the Study 1

2.2 Key Words 1

2.3 Research Aim and Research Questions 1

2.4 Rationale for the Research 1

2.5 Research Method 3

2.6 Limitation of the Study 3

3 Structure 4

4 Content 4

4.1 First Chapter: Introduction 4

4.2 Second Chapter: Social Justice in the History of the Pentecostal Movement 4

4.3 Third Chapter: Social Justice in Current Pentecostal Theology 7

4.4 Fourth Chapter: Social Justice according to Jürgen Moltmann 10

4.5 Fifth Chapter: Differences and Commonalities of Pentecostals and Moltmann: A Dialogue 11

4.6 Sixth Chapter: Conclusion 11

1. Abstract

This paper considers the current intra-Pentecostal discussion on the subject of *Social Justice,* and brings this into dialogue with Jürgen Moltmann. The positions shall be examined in respect of rationale, form and practice. Thus a contribution will be made to the understanding of Pentecostal, pneumatologically substantiated social justice. The form of this social justice will be outlined and the resulting conclusions for a constructive proposal will be deduced.

1. Scope of the Study
	1. Title of the Study

 “Social justice within the Pentecostal movement, in dialogue with Jürgen Moltmann: Rationale, form and practice”

* 1. Key words

Social justice, social ethics, Pentecostal theology, pneumatology, Moltmann, Hollenweger, Yong, Macchia, Wenk, Solivan, Stephenson.

* 1. Research Aim and Research Questions

The aim of the research is to develop a pneumatological rationale for Pentecostal social justice, as well as to outline its form and significance in practice. This goal is to be reached by correlating the current academic intra-Pentecostal discourse with Jürgen Moltmann and examining both positions for their rationale, form and practice. Specifically, the following questions shall be examined:

1. How do Pentecostal theologians justify pneumatological social justice and…
2. …what form would this take, and what practice would this lead to?
3. In what way does the Pentecostal position differ from, complement or correspond with, Jürgen Moltmann’s approach?
	1. Rationale for the Research

I received my first theological foundations in a Pentecostal church with a narrow eschatological and pneumatological understanding, in which social-ethical questions were scarcely a theme. Then in my studies I came across, besides other theologians, Jürgen Moltmann, who gave me a far broader eschatological and pneumtological understanding than I previously had. Ever since, Moltmann has shaped my theology and practice significantly.

Within German-speaking regions, various Pentecostal movement magazines are published, in which current church theological themes are discussed.[[1]](#footnote-1)1 The theme of s*ocial justice,* however, is more or less absent. Equally nonexistent is an academic rationale for a socio-ethic that relates to the German-speaking Pentecostal context.[[2]](#footnote-2)2 As a result of current societal developments, we pastors are being confronted with the subject of social justice. Currently we can raise questions about such responsibility on the basis of our (German-speaking Pentecostal) theological foundation, but can scarcely answer them. Within English-speaking regions there is an intra-Pentecostal academic discourse on this theme, which is hardly perceived in German-language regions.[[3]](#footnote-3)3

I was greatly astonished when I realised that social justice is not merely a subject, but is also reflected within the intra-Pentecostal discussion sociologically, missiologically and theologically, in the debate within academic Pentecostal theology. I discovered that very important developments and impetus from the global Pentecostal movement had passed by the German-language Pentecostal church, more or less without a trace.

With *Jürgen Moltmann* we have a European theologian whose theology and ethics show an affinity with Pentecostal theology (Moltmann, like the Pentecostals, essentially establishes his theology pneumatologically and eschatologically). Moltmann has developed his theology independently and he does not shy away from critically questioning the prevailing political and theological systems. Furthermore, Moltmann has already been singled out several times by Pentecostal theologians as a dialogue partner.[[4]](#footnote-4)4

By focusing on *pneumatology,* this study concentrates on a neglected dimension of social justice: the Holy Spirit. In the past, liberation theology has rather emphasised the role of God as a liberator of the oppressed (through election and exodus), as well as in the life and ministry of Jesus. The pneumatological dimension, the significance of Pentecost for social justice and liberation, tended to be neglected.

There are, however, exceptions: in 1974 a volume with essays by the Catholic theologian Johann Baptist Menz was published under the title “The Mystical and Political Dimensions of the Christian Faith”. In this publication social justice was brought into relationship with specific pneumatological subjects. Three years later, in 1977, in “Sanctification and Liberation” (edited by Theodore Runyan) James Cone published an essay about healing in the black church, about the significance of pneumatology in the transformation of identity of black Christians. More recently contributions have been made in respect of the significance of pneumatology for social justice by Michael Welker and Jürgen Moltmann: in 1994 Welker wrote an essay in “Gottes Geist and Gottes Volk im Umbruch Europas” (‘*God’s Spirit and God’s people in the turmoil of Europe’* Trans.) with the title “Gottes Geist und die Verheißung sozialer Gerechtigkeit in multikultureller Vielfalt” (‘*God’s Spirit and the promise of social justice within multi-cultural diversity’* Trans.) (pp. 9-29). Moltmann, in his 1991 publication “Der Geist des Lebens: Eine ganzheitliche Pneumatologie” (*‘The Spirit of Life: a holistic pneumatology’* Trans.) has, amongst other things, dealt extensively with this subject. In this respect, research on pneumatology within the subject area of social justice is a (relatively) new field of theological reflection.

These observations have prompted me to select the subject of the present study: “Social justice in the Pentecostal movement in dialogue with Jürgen Moltmann: rationale, form and practice.”

* 1. Research method

The research work shall be conducted by the principle of constructive theology developed in dialogue. The dialogue shall be conducted, on the one hand, with five exponents of the Pentecostal church family. On the other hand, this intra-Pentecostal dialogue shall then in turn be brought into conversation with a Reformed Lutheran outside voice (Moltmann). The research method of my study is, in this sense, an *academic literature study.* The literatureshall include relevant primary and secondary literature from academic Pentecostal theology, as well as the works of Jürgen Moltmann.

* 1. Limitation of the study

With the presentation of the Pentecostal socio-ethical position on global responsibility this study shall use intra-Pentecostal and relevant non-Pentecostal publications. With the presentation of the positions of Moltmann in this study, first and foremost I shall be using his primary literature. In this study the theology of the ‘oneness wing’ of the Pentecostals will not be taken into consideration.

1. Structure

**1 Introduction**

* 1. Preliminary Remarks/Justification for the Study
	2. Purpose and Aim of This Present Study

1.3 Research Question(s)

1.4 Structure

1.5 Research Method

1.6 Sources

1.7 Limitations of This Study

**2 Social justice and pneumatology: an unusual partnership?**

2.1 Pneumatology and Social Justice: A Short Biography

2.2 Social Justice at the Beginning of the Pentecostal Movement

2.3 Walter Hollenweger: the Anatomy of a Pioneer and Forerunner

2.4 What now…?

**3 Pneumatologically justified social justice within Pentecostal theology: a selection**

2.3 Amos Young

2.4 Frank Macchia

2.5 Matthias Wenk

2.6 Samuel Solivan

2.7 Lisa Stephenson: A Feminist Approach

**3 Social justice according to Jürgen Moltmann**

3.1 Centre and Focus of Moltmann’s Pneumatology

3.2 Pneumatology and Social Justice

3.3 …

**4 Differences and commonalities of the Pentecostals and Moltmann: a dialogue**

4.1 Comparison of the Different Positions

4.2 Findings

4.3 Further Studies:

4.3.1 Further Inquiries into Pentecostal Theology

4.3.2 A Pentecostal Comment on the Theology of Jürgen Moltmann

**5 Conclusion**

5.1 Theses

5.2 Closing words

**6 Bibliography**

1. Content
	1. First Chapter: Introduction

In the introduction the justification, purpose and aim, rationale, research method, and limitation of the study shall be expounded. As regards content, the introduction more or less accords with Chapters 1 and 2 of the above proposal.

* 1. Second Chapter: Social Justice in the History of the Pentecostal Movement

The aim of Chapter 2 is: a) a short summary, to outline the history and significance of social justice in the Pentecostal movement and b) to give a brief overview of the non-Pentecostal pneumatologically-justified theology of social justice. This chapter is divided into four sub-chapters:

1. **Pneumatology and social justice: a short biography of an unusual partnership**

This section gives an overview of the subject area “Pneumatologically justified social justice”. Here I demonstrate that traditionally pneumatology and liberation are not considered together. Therefore I shall refer to the conventional rationale for social justice within religious social and liberation theology (God as the liberator of the oppressed in the Exodus experience, as well as in Jesus’ life and ministry). Likewise the *religiöse Sozilaen* (religious socialists) around Karl Barth, Dietrich Bonhoeffer, and Leonhard Ragaz shall be briefly mentioned here. References to pneumatology and social justice are certainly also found outside the Pentecostal movement. So here I shall present the few exceptions, such as James Cone and Johann Baptist Menz. Equally contributions from Welker and Moltmann are already mentioned here. Preliminary literature:

Bonhoeffer, Dietrich 2006. *Ethik*. Gütersloh: Gütersloher Verlagshaus.

Cone, James 1981. Sanctification and Liberation in the Black religious Tradition. *Sanctification and Liberation: Liberation Theologies in the Light of the Wesleyan Tradition* (edit. Theodore Runyan). Abingdon Press. pp. 174-192.

Menz, Johann Baptist 1974. *The Mystical and Political Dimensions of the Christian Faith.* New Jersey: Paulist Press.

Moltmann, Jürgen 1991. *Der Geist des Lebens*. Gütersloh: Chr. Kaiser/Gütersloher Verlagshaus.

Runyon, Theodore (Hrsg.) 1977. *Sanctification and Liberation: Liberation Theologies in Light of the Wesleyan Tradition*. Abingdon Press.

Ruddies, Hartmut 2004. Religiöse Sozialisten. *RGG4* 7,410-411.

Ragaz, Clara (Hrsg.) 1952. *Mein Weg*. Bd 1 & 2. Zürich: Diana Verlag.

Ragaz Leonhard Mein Weg Bd I & II.

Welker 1994.. Gottes Geist und die Verheißung sozialer Gerechtigkeit in multikultureller Vielfalt. *Gottes Geist und Gottes Volk im Umbruch Europas.* (p. 9-29.)

Stähli, Martin Johann 1976. *Reich Gottes und Revolution. Christliche Theorie und Praxis für die Armen dieser Welt. Die Theologie des Religiösen Sozialismus bei Leonhard Ragaz und die Theologie der Revolution in Lateinamerika.* Theologische Forschung, 57. .Hamburg: Verlag Reich Hamburg

1. **Social justice at the beginning of the Pentecostal movement**

Various Pentecostal theologians in their publications refer to the significance of s*ocial justice* in the beginnings of the Pentecostal movement. In an overview some of these sources shall be highlighted. Inevitably the first reference to Walter Hollenweger shall be made. My aim is to demonstrate, briefly and concisely, that the common practice at the beginning of the movement was profoundly socially relevant, because it constituted a marked contrast to the established secular culture (also in comparison with other churches at that time). Preliminary literature:

Bartlemann, Frank 1982. *Azusa Street*. Newe Kerrington: Whitaker House.

Burgess, Stanley M. & Van der Maas, Eduard M. 2003. *The New International Dictionary of Pentecostal and Charismatic Movements. Revised and Extended Edition*. Grand Rapids, Michigan: Zondervan.

Dempster, Murray W. (et al) 1991. *Called & Empowered: Global Mission in Pentecostal Perspective*. Peabody Massachusetts: Hendrikson Publishers.

Chanda Victor, 2008. Pentecostal Theology and social involvement: *A study of the theological and ethical significance of a Pentecostal Theology in dealing with social matters*. Thesis M. Th. (Systematic Theology) University of South Africa.

1. **Walter Hollenweger: analysis of a pioneer and forerunner**

Why include a section on Walter Hollenweger? There are several sound reasons for this: On the one hand, Hollenweger is a pioneer and an important forerunner of the academic debate with Pentecostal theology. On the other hand, he has made substantial contributions within and outside the Pentecostal movement on pneumatology and also in the subject area of social justice. The significance and influence of Walter Hollenweger with respect to Pentecostal theology can hardly be overstated.[[5]](#footnote-5)5 One aspect which makes Hollenweger particularly interesting with regard to my research work is that he repeatedly made a connection between pneumatology and social justice in his works and pointed out the importance of this (see e.g. Hollenweger 1997:305ff). Preliminary literature:

Hollenweger, Walter J. 1969. *Enthusiastisches Christentum. Die Pfingstbewegung in Geschichte und Gegenwart.* Zürich: Zwingli Verlag.

Hollenweger, Walter J. 1997*. Charismatisch-pfingstliches Christentum. Herkunft, Situation, ökumenische Chance.* Göttingen: Vandenhoekc und Ruprecht.

Hollenweger, Walter J. 2003. Social Justice and the Pentecostal/Charismatic Movement. *NIDPCM*

Hollenweger, Walter J. 1988. *Geist und Materie. Interkulturelle Theologie III.* München: Kaiser Verlag München.

Hollenweger, Walter J. 1974. *Pentecost between Black and White: Five Case Studies on Pentecost and Politics.* Belfast: Christian Journals Ltd.

Anderson, Allan & Hollenweger, Walter 1999. *Pentecostals after a Century. Global Perspectives on a Movement in* *Transition*. 15. Journals of Pentecostal Theology Supplement Series. Sheffield, England: Sheffield Academic Press.

1. **What Now?**

The emphasis of social justice could hardly be more diverse within the worldwide Pentecostal movement. Questions of social justice are already imposing themselves in many nations of the majority world through pre-existing political, economic/commercial and ecological circumstances, so this theme was neglected for a long time in the European and North American Pentecostal churches (Hollenweger 2003:1076; Warrington 2008:226ff). The fact that this is changing for the better is shown solely by the publications, which already explicitly carry concerns for social justice. Many churches and movements are discovering anew the importance of social concern, and are making this into an important agenda item of their societal engagement (Warrington 2008:229ff), be this of a political nature, in fight against poverty and sickness, education, as well as peace and reconciliation endeavours (Volf 2012; Warrington 2008:236). Preliminary literature:

Warrington, Keith 2008. *Pentecostal Theology. A Theology of encounter*. London: T & T Clark International.

Volf, Miroslav 1986. Materiality of salvation: an investigation in the soteriologies of liberation and pentecostal theology. *Journal of ecumenical studies*. No. 26/3,447-467.

Anderson, Allan & Hollenweger, Walter 1999. *Pentecostals after a Century. Global Perspectives on a Movement in* *Transition*. 15. Journals of Pentecostal Theology Supplement Series. Sheffield, England: Sheffield Academic Press.

Hollenweger, Walter J. 2003. Social Justice and the Pentecostal/Charismatic Movement. *NIDPCM*

Miller, Donald E. & Yamamori, Tetsunao 2007. *Global Pentecostalism. The new Face of Christian Social Engagement*. Los Angeles, California: University of California Press.

* 1. Third chapter: social justice in current Pentecostal theology

In the following chapter I shall examine in particular five Pentecostal theologians who have justified their socio-ethic pneumatologically. The selection of the five theologians was made according to the following criteria: All of them are established and recognised Pentecostal theologians who have made significant contributions within the framework of a pneumatologically justified social-ethic. Together they provide a broad range of perspectives and approaches, which shall be described in detail in the discourse. The following Pentecostal Theologians are brought into dialogue with each other:

**Amos Yong:**

Yong has published extensive and comprehensive material on social justice and political theology, and is one of the most prominent voices among Pentecostal theologians. Preliminary literature:

Yong, Amos 2012. *Spirit of Love: A Trinitarian Theology of Grace.* Waco, TX: Baylor University Press

Yong, Amos 2010. *In the days of Caesar: Pentecostalism and Political Theology – The Cadbury Lectures 2009.* Sacra Doctrina: Christian Theology for a Postmodern Age Series. Grand Rapids: William B. Eerdmans Publishing Company.

Attanasi, Katherine & Yong, Amos 2012. *Pentecostalism and Prosperity*.

Alexander, Estrelda & Yong, Amos (Hrsg.) 2009*. Philip's Daughters. Women in Pentecostal-Charismatic Leadership*. Eugene, Oregon: Pickwick Publications.

Yong Amos 2011. *The Bible, Disability, and the Church. A New Vision of the People of God*. Grand Rapids, Michigan: Wm. B. Erdmanns Publishing co.

Vondey, Wolfgang & Mittelstadt, Martin William (Hrsg.) 2013*. The Theology of Amos Yong and the New Face of Pentecostal Scholarship. Passion for the Spirit*. Leiden, Netherlands: Brill Academic Publications.

**Frank Macchia**

Macchia, together with Yong, is counted as one of probably the two most renowned systematic theologians in current Pentecostal theology. Preliminary literature:

Macchia, Frank D. 1993. Spirituality and Social Liberation: The Message of the Blumhardts in the Light of Wuerttemberg Pietism. N.J., & London: The Scarecrow Press, Inc. Metuchen.

Macchia, Frank D. 2006. Babel and the Tongues of Pentecost: Reversal or Fulfilment? A Theological Perspective. Speaking in Tongues: Multidisciplinary Perspectives, Mark Cartledge, ed. Pater Noster

Macchia, Frank D. 2006. Baptized in the Spirit: A Global Pentecostal Theology. Grand Rapids, Michigan: Zondervan. (in particular the section p.219-221 and p. 278-280)

Macchia, Frank D. 2003. “Theology, Pentecostal,” in Burgess, [Stanley M.](http://www.amazon.com/s/ref%3Dntt_athr_dp_sr_1?_encoding=UTF8&sort=relevancerank&search-alias=books&field-author=Stanley%20M.%20Burgess) & Van der Maas, 1120-1140.

Macchia, Frank D. The Kingdom and the Power: Spirit Baptism in Pentecostal and Ecumenical Perspective.The Work of the Spirit: Pneumatology and Pentecostalism, Michael Welker (Hrsg.) 2006. Grand Rapids: William B. Eerdmans Publishing Company.

Macchia, Frank D. Baptized in the Spirit:Reflections in Response to My Reviewers”. In: Journal of Pentecostal Theology 16(2008) pp.14–20

**Samuel Solivan**

Although Solivan completed his academic career primarily in the USA, he supplemented the discussion on social justice with the perspective of a Latin-American, using theology originating from Puerto Rico. Preliminary literature:

Solivan, Samuel 1998. *The Spirit, Pathos and Liberation. Toward an Hispanic Pentecostal Theology*. Sheffield, UK: Sheffield Academic Press Ltd.

[Solivan, Samuel](http://www.latinobibliography.org/biblio/author/Solivan-Roman?sort=keyword&order=asc). [The Need for a North American Hispanic Theology](http://www.latinobibliography.org/node/6911). Listening: Journal of Religion and Culture, Volume 27, Number 1, p. 17, (1992) od. [Solivan, Samuel](http://www.latinobibliography.org/biblio/author/Solivan-Roman?sort=keyword&order=asc). [The Need for a North American Hispanic Theology](http://www.latinobibliography.org/node/6912). Mestizo Christianity: Theology from the Latino Perspective, Maryknoll, NY, pp. 44-52, (1992)

Solivan, Samuel 1993. Cultural Glossolalia in Acts 2: A Theological Reassessment of the Importance of Culture and Language. Society for Pentecostal Studies, papers of the annual conferences. *Pneuma* . 25.

**Matthias Wenk**

In comparison with the other selected theologians, Wenk falls outside the framework: He is a New Testament scholar and not a systematic theologian. His place in the discussion is nevertheless more than merely justified because he belongs amongst the currently most significant German-speaking Pentecostal theologians and moreover he has published several articles on a pneumatologically justified social-ethic. Furthermore, his thesis as a New Testament scholar deals with the social-ethical dimension of two volume work from Luke. Wenk enriches the discussion with a Swiss–European perspective. Preliminary literature:

Wenk, Matthias 2013. Der Heilige Geist als Solidarität Gottes mit den Bedrängten und Ausgestossenen. *Das Evangelium den Armen. Die Pfingstbewegung im Spannungsfeld zwischen sozialer Verantwortung und klassischem Missionsverständnis*. Kiel: Bereithschuh & Kock, p. 95.

Wenk, Matthias 2013. Holy Spirit. *Dictionary of Jesus and the Gospels*. 387-94

Wenk, Matthias 2006. Pneumatologische Ansätze in der gegenwärtigen pfingstlichen Theologie. *Theologische Zeitschrift. Nr. 4/62*, 530-49

Wenk, Matthias 2002. The Holy Spirit as Transforming Power within a society: Political/Social Relevance for Western Europe. *JPT 11/1,* 130-42.

Wenk, Matthias 2000. *Community-Forming Power. The Socio-Ethical Role of the Spirit in Luke-Acts.* Sheffield, UK: Sheffield Academic Press.

**Lisa Stephenson**

Stephenson enriches the pneumatologically justified socio-ethical discussion by an unusual approach in Pentecostal theology: The feminist perspective. This approach is however also interesting in this respect because feminist theology is a continuation of liberation theology. Preliminary literature:

Stephenson, Lisa 2011. *Dismantling the Dualisms for American Pentecostal Women in Ministry: A Feminist Pneumatological Approach*. Leiden, Netherlands: Brill Academic Publications.

“A Feminist Pentecostal Theological Anthropology: North America and Beyond.” Pneuma 35, no. 1 (2013): 35-47.

“Spirit, Voices, and Bodies: Feminist Pentecostal Theologies Taking Shape.” Pneuma 35, no. 1 (2013): 5-7.

“Prophetically Political, Politically Prophetic: William Cavanaugh’s ‘Theopolitical Imagination’ as an Example of Walter Brueggemann’s ‘Prophetic Imagination.’” Journal of Church and State 53 (2011): 567-86.

“Prophesying Women and Ruling Men: Women’s Religious Authority in North American Pentecostalism.” Religions 2, no. 3 (2011): 410-26.

“Religious Symbols and Ecclesial Practices: Women’s Full Humanity and Their Status Within the Church,” Pax Pneuma 5, no. 2 (Fall 2009): 48-53.

“Directed, Ordered, and Related: The Male and Female Interpersonal Relation in Karl Barth’s Church Dogmatics.” Scottish Journal of Theology 61, no. 4 (2008): 435-49.

 “Spiritual Presence and the Divine Feminine: A Tillichian-Pentecostal-Feminist Spirituality.” In Spiritual Presence and Spiritual Power: Pentecostal Readings of and Engagement with the Legacy of Paul Tillich. Edited by Amos Yong and Nimi Wariboko, forthcoming.

“Imaging God, Embodying Christ: A Pentecostal Contribution to a ‘New’- matological Argument for Women in Ministry.” In Raising Women Leaders: Perspectives on Liberating Women in Pentecostal and Charismatic Contexts. Edited by Shane Clifton and Jacqui Grey, 175-90. Sydney, Australia: Australasian Pentecostal Studies, 2009.

In the course of this work I shall make contact with the various dialogue partners and discuss in detail my selection of literature. In particular, this is necessary in the case of Solivan because as yet I have only sparse knowledge about his work.

* 1. Fourth Chapter: Social Justice according to Jürgen Moltmann

I have already explained above the reason for Moltmann being selected as a dialogue partner. I shall probably divide Chapter four into *rationale*, *form,* and *practice*. I shall further subdivide the *form* section into four subsections, as follows: a) exploitation of people by people, b) political oppression, c) solidarity against the alienation of people, and d) fighting for the hope of individual people. Why this structure? According to Moltmann social justice is inextricably linked with the term salvation. This clearly emerges in the summarised exposition of his understanding of salvation:

1. Salvation acts in the struggle for economic justice against the exploitation of people by people; 2. Salvation acts in the struggle for human dignity against political oppression by his fellow man; 3. Salvation acts in the struggle for solidarity against the alienation of people; 4. Salvation acts in the struggle for hope against desperation in the lives of individuals. Without social justice no political freedom, without political freedom no overcoming of cultural alienation, without cultural identity no personal hope – and vice versa. The four dimensions hang together, but there are priorities in different situations. There are various gifts and callings, but there is one Spirit and one salvation (Moltmann 2010:56).

Salvation is, according to Moltmann, all-embracing, when “we embrace the world with the heart of Christ”. “The God who created justice, who suffered violence; the God who raised up the humiliated and executed Christ, this is the God of hope for a new world of justice and of peace” (:59). In this respect salvation involves an ethic, which is orientated towards this very same God; it is “neither adapted global responsibility nor separatist escapism, but rather instructions for changing the world”. Preliminary literature:

Moltmann, Jürgen 1984. *Politische Theologie*. Gütersloh: Chr. Kaiser/Gütersloher Verlagshaus.

Moltmann, Jürgen 2010. *Ethik der Hoffnung*. Gütersloh: Chr. Kaiser/Gütersloher Verlagshaus.

Moltmann, Jürgen 1989a. *Kirche in Kraft des Geistes. Ein Beitrag zur messianischen Ekklesiologie.* München: Kaiserverlag

Moltmann, Jürgen 1991. *Der Geist des Lebens*. Gütersloh: Chr. Kaiser/Gütersloher Verlagshaus.

Muntenau, Daniel. 2003. *Der tröstende Geist der Liebe. Zu einer ökumenischen Lehre vom Heiligen Geist über die trinitarischen Theologien J. Moltmanns und D. Stăniloaes.* Neukirch: Neukirchner Verlag.

* 1. Fifth Chapter: Differences and commonalities of Pentecostals and Moltmann: a dialogue

In this chapter, in a first stage, the positions of the five Pentecostal theologians will be examined together. In the second stage, the Pentecostal approach will be set into dialogue with Moltmann. What do the dialogue partners have in common, where do their positions complement each other, where do they contradict each other?

In a continuation I shall present questions to Pentecostal theology, which arise from the dialogue. Subsequently I shall also formulate a Pentecostal statement on the position of Jürgen Moltmann.

* 1. Sixth Chapter: Conclusion

I shall summarise the most important insights at the end of the study in the form of a thesis. It is also important to me to briefly express what being confronted with a pneumatologically justified socio-ethic has effectively stirred and changed within me personally.

1. 1 “Online” the denominational magazine of BewegungPlus (apostolic church network), “Zoom” denominational magazine of the Swiss Pentecostal mission (Assemblies of God) , etc. [↑](#footnote-ref-1)
2. 2 Just how vague and unconsidered the use of the term *global responsibility* generally is in German-speaking theology, will become apparent in Paragraph 7.1. [↑](#footnote-ref-2)
3. 3 In contrast to the intra-Pentecostal discourse the examination of the Pentecostal church as a phenomenon has nowadays become relatively popular. E.g. the *Interdisziplinäre Arbeitskreis Pfingstbewegung* describes itself as “… a forum for the networking of research work on Pentecostal and charismatic movements worldwide. It was founded on 11th June 2004 in Heidelberg. The working group networks people within German-speaking regions who are interested in academic research on Pentecostal/charismatic movements in the fields of theology, religious studies, sociology, ethnology and psychology, or those who are themselves conducting such research” (<http://www.glopent.net/iak-pfingstbewegung/ueber-uns>). Insofar as the working group is a forum for research of the Pentecostal *movement* and its *history*, it does not however participate in the *development* of its theology. The three most renowned intra-Pentecostal academic periodicals which deal academically with Pentecostal theology are the Journal of Pentecostal Theology (JPT), the Journal of the European Pentecostal Theological Association (JEPTA) and the Asian Journal of Pentecostal Studies (AJPS). [↑](#footnote-ref-3)
4. 4 E.g. Althouse, Peter 2003. *Spirit of the Last Days. Pentecostal Eschatology in Conversation with Jürgen Moltmann.* 25. Journals of Pentecostal Theology Supplement Series. London: T & T Clark International. [↑](#footnote-ref-4)
5. 5 Another passing remark: without wanting to ‘lean out of the window too far’, I increasingly get the impression that, in his complete works, Hollenweger is developing his own narrative, Pentecostal systematic theology. [↑](#footnote-ref-5)